

“All the News
That’s Fit to Print”

The New York Times

THE WEATHER
Today, some morning rain, mostly cloudy, mild, high 62. **Tonight**, remaining mostly cloudy, dry, low 48. **Tomorrow**, clouds, limited sunshine, high 55. Weather map, Page B10.

VOL. CLXXIII . . . No. 59,967 © 2023 The New York Times Company THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 9, 2023 Prices in Canada may be higher \$4.00



FLEEING TO THE SOUTH A desperate exodus of Gaza City residents continued on Wednesday as Israeli troops advanced. Page A10. SAMAR ABU ELOUF FOR THE NEW YORK TIMES

As Gaza War Rages, Business Leaders, Often Vocal, Tread Lightly

By EMMA GOLDBERG
After reading the details of Hamas's attacks on Israel on Oct. 7, Brad Karp, who runs the law firm Paul, Weiss, sat at his computer and wrote a memo to his roughly 2,000 employees.
He didn't ask the firm's spokesman to draft it; he channeled his grief into a companywide email and hit send, just as he was moved to do after the overturning of Roe v. Wade and the killing of George Floyd. But as an American business leader condemning Hamas's

attacks, he said, he felt surprisingly lonely.
“I was disappointed that fewer leaders than I anticipated spoke out emphatically, clearly and with moral clarity on this issue,” Mr. Karp said. “If you asked any of these leaders whether they were horrified by the slaughter of innocent civilians by Hamas, they would tell you privately that they were horrified.”
Company executives have, over the last month, faced a dilemma that they're by now well practiced in confronting: whether to engage with a large humanitarian or so-

Mideast’s Complexities Give Pause Despite Pressure to Speak

cial issue, in this case the war between Israel and Hamas. This time, many say, responding — with a public statement, internal discussion, a donation or even social media parameters for staff members — presents complexities that they have not experi-

enced when wading into other recent social crises.
“If you release a statement about the damage of a hurricane, there's nobody who will say, ‘Actually that area of the country deserved a hurricane,’” said Iliya Rybchin, a partner at the consultancy Elixirr, who has advised dozens of Fortune 500 chief executives.
More than 200 American businesses have issued statements condemning the Hamas attacks in Israel that killed roughly 1,400 people, according to a tracker *Continued on Page A11*

Hamas’s Goal for Oct. 7: A Permanent State of War

Group’s Leaders Say Carnage Was Needed to Restore Focus on Palestinians

By BEN HUBBARD and MARIA ABI-HABIB
DOHA, Qatar — Thousands have been killed in Gaza, with entire families wiped out. Israeli airstrikes have reduced Palestinian neighborhoods to expanses of rubble, while doctors treat screaming children in darkened hospitals with no anesthesia. Across the Middle East, fear has spread over the possible outbreak of a broader regional war.
But in the bloody arithmetic of Hamas's leaders, the carnage is not the regrettable outcome of a big miscalculation. Quite the opposite, they say: It is the necessary cost of a great accomplishment — the shattering of the status quo and the opening of a new, more volatile chapter in their fight against Israel.
It was necessary to “change the entire equation and not just have a clash,” Khalil al-Hayya, a member of Hamas's top leadership body, told The New York Times in Doha, Qatar. “We succeeded in putting the Palestinian issue back on the table, and now no one in the region is experiencing calm.”
Since the shocking Hamas attack on Oct. 7, in which Israel says about 1,400 people were killed — most of them civilians — and more than 240 others dragged back to Gaza as captives, the group's leaders have praised the operation, with some hoping it will set off a sustained conflict that ends any pretense of coexistence among Israel, Gaza and the countries around them.
“I hope that the state of war with Israel will become permanent on all the borders, and that the Arab world will stand with us,” Taher El-Nounou, a Hamas media adviser, told The Times.
In weeks of interviews, Hamas leaders, along with Arab, Israeli and Western officials who track the group, said the attack had been planned and executed by a tight circle of commanders in Gaza who did not share the details with their own political representatives abroad or with their regional allies like Hezbollah, leaving people outside the enclave surprised by the ferocity, scale and reach of the assault.
The attack ended up being broader and more deadly than even its planners had anticipated, they said, largely because the assailants managed to break through Israel's vaunted defenses with ease, allowing them to overrun military bases and residential areas with little resistance. As Hamas stormed through a swath of southern Israel, it killed and captured more soldiers and civilians than it expected to, officials said.
The assault was so devastating that it served one of the plotters' main objectives: It broke a longstanding tension within Hamas about the group's identity and purpose. Was it mainly a governing body — responsible for managing day-to-day life in the blockaded Gaza Strip — or was it still *Continued on Page A12*

HOSTAGE TALKS FALTER Efforts to free up to 50 captives stalled after Israel's invasion of Gaza. Hopes of a deal have faded since. **PAGE A13**
MIDEAST ENDGAME Antony J. Blinken laid out a scenario in which Gaza would be unified with the West Bank after the war. **PAGE A10**

Women Ready To Answer Call In Ukraine War

By ANDREW E. KRAMER and MARIA VARENIKOVA
KYIV, Ukraine — Halyna Vynokur, a clerk in a hardware store in Kyiv, was shouldering a firearm for the first time. Iryna Sychova, a purchasing manager at a department store, disassembled and reassembled the jumble of rods and springs in a Kalashnikov rifle.
They were among two dozen women who turned out in a forest near Kyiv one recent weekend for a course in firearms and urban combat, training that included shooting rifles, finding booby traps and throwing hand grenades. They were spurred by a sense of duty, they said, realizing they might someday end up on the front lines.
“Nobody wants to fight in the trenches,” said Olha Bakmatova, 46, a psychologist who attended the training. “It's unnatural to want it.” But she felt it was “inevitable” that more women would wind up fighting, and she wanted to be prepared.
“Now, I understand: If not me, who?” she said.
After 20 months of full-scale war, the fighting in Ukraine has bogged down in vicious battles of attrition along a zigzag front line in the southeast. A steady supply of weapons and personnel is crucial, and while Ukraine has the benefit of Western-donated armaments, it relies on only its own population as a pool for replenishing forces — and Russia's is about three times as large.
With so much hinging on refilling the ranks, efforts are underway to draw more Ukrainian *Continued on Page A6*



The three pandas at the National Zoo in Washington were flown to China on Wednesday. ERIN SCHAFF/THE NEW YORK TIMES

Saying Goodbye as Panda Diplomacy Wanes

By EDWARD WONG
WASHINGTON — The Smithsonian's National Zoo in the heart of Washington has panda posters, panda mugs, panda pajamas, panda puzzles and even panda ice cream.
It has a phalanx of employees and volunteers who monitor panda heart rates, aid in panda reproduction and tend the bamboo that pandas eat.
What the zoo no longer has are the giant pandas themselves.
On Wednesday, the two adult pandas, Mei Xiang and Tian Tian, and their 3-year-old cub, Xiao Qi Ji, were coaxed into individual

Amid Rising Tensions, U.S. Zoos’ Pacts With China Wind Down

metal crates on a cloudless autumn morning and driven in trucks to a FedEx Boeing 777 called the Panda Express.
Their exit was accorded all the pomp of the presidential motorcades that zip through Washington: police escorts, waving bystanders and trailing journalists.
The aircraft, loaded with 220 pounds of bamboo, a veterinarian

and two zookeepers, took off for the 19-hour flight from Dulles International Airport to China. There, the bears will join about 150 other pandas in a lush nature preserve in the misty mountains of Sichuan Province.
And with that, an era of panda diplomacy ends, at least for now.
“It's been a hard week, and it's been a hard morning,” Brandie Smith, the zoo director, told us journalists as we watched the crates with their furry occupants being moved by forklifts from the bamboo-lined Asia Trail area.
“Please know that the future is bright for giant pandas,” she added *Continued on Page A8*

Actors Reach Tentative Deal To End Strike

This article is by Brooks Barnes, John Koblin and Nicole Sperling.
LOS ANGELES — One of the longest labor crises in Hollywood history is finally coming to an end.
SAG-AFTRA, the union representing tens of thousands of actors, reached a tentative deal for a new contract with entertainment companies on Wednesday, clearing the way for the \$134 billion American movie and television business to swing back into motion.
Hollywood's assembly lines have been at a near-standstill since May because of a pair of strikes by writers and actors, resulting in financial pain for studios and for many of the two million Americans — makeup artists, set builders, location scouts, chauffeurs, casting directors — who work in jobs directly or indirectly related to making TV shows and films.
Upset about streaming-service pay and fearful of fast-developing artificial intelligence technology, actors joined screenwriters on picket lines in July. The writers had walked out in May over similar concerns. It was the first time since 1960, when Ronald Reagan was the head of the actors' union and Marilyn Monroe was still starring in films, that actors and writers were both on strike.
The Writers Guild of America, which represents 11,500 screenwriters, reached a tentative agreement with studios on Sept. 24 and ended its 148-day strike on Sept. 27. In the coming days, SAG-AFTRA members will vote on whether to accept their union's deal, which includes hefty gains, *Continued on Page A24*



Ohioans enshrined abortion rights in their constitution. MADDIE MCGARVEY FOR THE NEW YORK TIMES

Elections Buoy Biden for Now, But '24 Looms

By PETER BAKER
WASHINGTON — Poll? What poll? The Democratic victories in Tuesday's off-year elections gave President Biden's White House some desperately needed breathing space just when it needed it.
After days of deepening angst within the party following a demoralizing survey that showed Mr. Biden losing in five key battleground states, Wednesday morning arrived with a sense of told-you-so vindication at a White House that has long insisted that polls don't matter, only elections do.
“The Democrats have got to quit their whining, quit their hand-wringing and do something,” Terry McAuliffe, the former governor of Virginia and onetime chairman of the Democratic National Committee, said in an interview. “Last night was just a huge gust of wind in our sails. This is all doable. There is a lot of excitement out there. Let's *Continued on Page A17*



BUSINESS B1-6
In Texas, Progress Drones On
Amazon's much-hyped drone project is now a reality in College Station. But its future remains up in the air. **PAGE B1**
Meta Taps Into WhatsApp
Mark Zuckerberg had deliberately left the messaging app alone for over a decade. No longer. **PAGE B1**

INTERNATIONAL A4-13
Fast Lane for Migrants?
In Central America, Costa Rica and Panama are busing people northward to ease strain on their borders. **PAGE A4**
Severe Drought in Mideast
Human-made climate change is driving a yearslong extreme drought in Iran, Iraq and Syria, scientists said. **PAGE A8**
OBITUARIES A25
Olympic Pairs Figure Skater
Oleg Protopopov's balletic style helped him and his wife win two gold medals for the Soviet Union before they defected to the West. He was 91.

NATIONAL A14-24
Former Grammys Boss Is Sued
On Wednesday, an unnamed instrumentalist accused Neil Portnow of drugging and raping her in a New York hotel room in 2018. **PAGE A24**
Ivanka Trump on the Stand
Donald J. Trump's eldest daughter was questioned on her father's finances, the state's final witness in the ex-president's civil fraud trial in New York. **PAGE A23**
Border Issue Hinders Allies' Aid
The G.O.P. and Democrats appear to agree that any war spending package must include immigration changes, but they are split on the details. **PAGE A22**



THURSDAY STYLES D1-6
Vapes Get Gen Z Makeover
Experts worry that new devices, in cute candy shades and egg shapes, will hook a new generation of users. **PAGE D5**
A Night of Winning Looks
The Council of Fashion Designers of America awards this week doubled down on glamour. **PAGE D1**

ARTS C1-6
Pulling the Right Strings
La MaMa Puppet Festival and other works this fall highlight the power of storytelling through puppetry. **PAGE C1**
An Artist's Journey
Edel Rodriguez's new graphic memoir of immigrating to the United States skewers the powerful once more. **PAGE C5**
OPINION A26-27
Michelle Cottle **PAGE A27**

